

## Minutes of Meeting

2<sup>nd</sup> meeting attended by following on 28<sup>th</sup> May, 2015 at 3.00 P.M. on 8<sup>th</sup> floor, Committee Hall and following were present;

1. Shri. M.A. Khan, ED(NB)
2. Mrs. Madhu Arora, GM (Estt.)
3. Mrs. Smita Choudhary, GM (EF)
4. Shri Prehlad Rai, GS, AIBSNLEA
5. Shri K. Sebastin, GS, SNEA (I)
6. Shri R.P. Sahu, GS, AIGETOA
7. Shri Manish Kumar, DGM (Pers.)- Convenor

Shri Manish Kumar welcomed all. Minutes of 1<sup>st</sup> meeting was given.

ED(NB) welcomed all and told that we will first deliberate on point no. 1 of E1 A to E2 pay scale and E2A to E3 pay scale issue.

As the figures given by ERP and HRMS package is circulated to all of you as per DPE letter dated 09.07.2014 states that E1A to E2A can not continue. We can't give lower pay. The calculation for financial burden is circulated to all of you. The total burden is 47.26 crore without arrear and without retrospectively and without cascading effect. E2A to E3 will have no financial burden as they are already at more than minimum of E3 scale. We can discuss, analyse and scrutinize the case now. We have no purview to go beyond E2 and E3.

GM (EF) asked for earlier meeting minutes but no earlier meeting was held it was told by association members. It is going to have impact on entire pay scale beyond E3 as told by GM(EF). It will have implication on MT Recruit Rules and pension contribution for E3 also. Financial figures to be worked out by Establishment and not by EF as told by GM (EF).

### GM (Estt.) told:

We have to study cascading effect. Clarity is required on this. Pension contribution amount will go very high. It may be 260 crore. During time of next pay revision it may have huge impact. It may impact affordability of pay revision in 2017.

Cabinet decision on MTNL pay reduction as per parity with BSNL is to be seen also.

### GS-SNEA told:

GS, SNEA (I) submitted the following view points: the demand of the Assns are implementation of standard pay scales since intermediary pay scales are not approved by DOT and DPE. In BSNL, E1A and E2A are the non standard pay scales, others are standard pay scales. DOT and DPE rejected the replacement scales proposed by BSNL, Rs. 18850-40500 and Rs. 22800-46500 for E1A and E2A respectively. Multiplication factor of 1.91 used by DPE and BSNL for arriving at revised E1, E1A, E2 and E2A scales and in any case the minimum of replacement scale of E1A and E2A cannot be less than Rs. 18850 and Rs. 22800, i.e. 1.91 times of 9850 and 1.91 times of 11875. DOT and DPE rejected the intermediary pay scales of E1A and E2A and directed to implement standard pay scales. So only option is to fit into standard pay scales of E2 and E3. Mandate given to the committee is very much limited "..... to examine the introduction of E2 and E3 pay scales for JTOs, SDEs and equivalent cadres". There is no scope for the committee to discuss something like

E1+5 increments etc. The MTNL cabinet decision is not applicable in the case of E1A and E2A since pay scale is not finalised. Committee has to decide on the mandate at the earliest as the issue is lingering on for last 5 years. A written submission on the whole issue is also presented.

**GS-AIBSNEA told:**

E2 and E3 pay scales we demand with reason. Presidential Directive was issued in 2009. In that also E1A and E2A were not mentioned in 2<sup>nd</sup> PRC no intermediary pay scales. We were raising this issue since 2<sup>nd</sup> PRC. BSNL formulated E1A and E2A. There was Mr. Pillai committee. Final view was to refer to DOT. DOT has now turned down. We requested to decide standard pay scale. E1 cannot be given as reduction in pay scale as it will not be acceptable. E2 and E3 pay scale fixing is the only choice now. Management can discuss repurcussion of pension or cascading effect.

**GS-AIGETOA told:**


We can't decide on DPE decision. E1A and E2A is scrapped. You can not reduce pay. E1A is to be given E2 only. Status and pay can not be reduced. On Deputation when we go to MTNL, BBNL, etc., we are fixed with lower status due to this anomaly so we are at loss. Only standard Pay scale are allowed. Without E2 no choice left. Even if implications are there, we can not deny the decision of DPE. 30% fitment was given then old E7 revised was not reaching E7 minimum, but it was given extra amount and fixed them at minimum of E7 scale. That time financial implication was not seen. Why?

**Discussion started:**

GM (EF): If you are in commercial organisation then financial implication is to be seen. GM(Estt.) told: pay scale parity will be achieved by bringing down MTNL pay scale at the time of next pay revision in 2017. MTNL has not lowered pay scales as on today. She will brief cascading effect paper in the next meeting. She will circulate the paper to all members by next week.


ED(NB) told that in next meeting all members should come with detailed calculation of financial impact and full analysis.

Next meeting will be held on 7<sup>th</sup> July, 2015 at 3.00 p.m. on 8<sup>th</sup> floor, Committee Hall.

  
ED(NB)

  
GS AIBSNEA

  
GM (Estt.)

  
GS SNEA (I)

  
GM (EF)

  
GS AGETOA

A-I/2



# FINANCIAL BURDEN ANALYSIS

EIA to E2

→ No = 3636

1. Basic Pay  $20600 - 19020 = 1580$
2. DA  $100\% = 1580$   
Total  $= 3160$
3. HRA (average 20%)  $1580 \times 9636 \times 12 \times 0.2 = 3.65 \text{ Crore}$
4. Pension (17%) Contribution  $E2 - E1 \times 0.17 \times 3500 \times 12$   
(Pensionable No = 3500)  $= (46500 - 40500) \times 0.17 \times 3500 \times 12$   
 $= 4.28 \text{ Crore}$
5. EPF (12%)  $= 12 \times 6136 \times 3160 \times 0.12 = 2.79 \text{ Cr}$   
(Direct Recruits = 6136)
6. PAY Difference  $= 3160 \times 9636 \times 12 = 36.54 \text{ Crore}$   
Total of (3 + 4 + 5 + 6)  $= 47.26 \text{ Crore}$   
E2A to E3  $\rightarrow \text{NIL}$

A-I/3

Status as on 21.05.2015  
AS PER HRMS SYSTEM

Scale AS PER ERP SYSTEM

	BSNL Recruits	Others	Total
E1A	<u>4055</u>	<u>2716</u>	6771
E2A	<u>3377</u>	2877	6254
TOTAL			13025

Total
<u>9636</u>
6975
16611

34 Circle  
15 District

9636  
3716  
5920

9636  
~~3716~~  
1

A-1/4



**09.07.2015 Committee meeting to discuss E-2, E-3 IDA pay scales for JTO/SDE level executive implementation of CPSU cadre hierarchy and first time bound promotion after 4 years in all the cases:**

GS attended the meeting held on today in the chairmanship of ED (NB), BSNL CO, New Delhi. In today's meeting committee has finally decided to extend E2 and E3 IDA pay scales in place of E1A and E2A. From the Association side, we strongly demanded arrear payment for the post 2007 batches but official side are in opinion that same should be paid later on profitability of the company. The committee will submit its recommendations with the views of all members. Final decision on arrear payments will be taken by the BSNL Board. Cascading effect is not in the purview of the committee hence, no comments are required at this stage. Next meeting of the committee is scheduled on 27th July 2015 in which discussions on CPSE cadre hierarchy will take place.

A-I/5

Minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Committee held on 27.07.2015 at 15.00 hours in the Meeting Room on 8<sup>th</sup> floor

Subject : CPSU cadre hierarchy and other matters.

4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Committee was attended by following :

- |    |                                |   |          |
|----|--------------------------------|---|----------|
| 1. | Shri M.A. Khan, ED(NB)         | - | Chairman |
| 2. | Mrs. Madhu Arora, GM(Estt.)    |   |          |
| 3. | Mrs. Smita Choudhary, GM(EF)   |   |          |
| 4. | Shri Prahlad Rai, GS, AIBSNLEA |   |          |
| 5. | Shri K. Sebastian, GS, SNEA(I) |   |          |
| 6. | Shri R.P. Sahu, GS, AIGETOA    |   |          |
| 7. | Shri Manish Kumar, DGM(Pers.)  | - | Convenor |

Shri Manish Kumar welcomed all. Copies of the minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting were circulated among the members.

**Chairman opening remarks :**

ED(NB) welcomed all and told that first we will be deliberate on point no. 2 of agenda.

Existing EPP and functional promotion to be removed. Replace it by time bound functional promotion. It will save money of company and will also improve performance of company as performers will move up faster. Selection process may be by interview with stringent ACR bench marks. Present lower evaluation bench marks are to be removed. As in Banks and CPSUs etc. promotion are given based on interview, to high performers. Time of CPC should not exceed 8 years or so. The assured promotion should be upto the level of DGM.

**GM(Estt.) :** Demand is that we have to follow other PSU. We have studied the policies of the other PSUs like BHEL, NTP etc. What we have noted that time bound financial upgradation is not there. There is just one policy i.e. promotion policy. The policy what they have has very stringent criteria of performance. We have prepared presentation based on BHEL. They are giving weightage based on various criteria like 'number of years of service, qualification etc. and they are preparing the list of the persons in descending order. WS. SR branch has prepared a table and distributed to all. And union oppose this that what we have got from DOT, you can not take it back. The union is demanding that they are getting money but they want promotion also. In our Organisational hierarchy, the persons getting E4 payscale is more than 13,000 nos. The functional hierarchy is JTO, SDE, DGM, GM. For 800 DGMs, there are 13,000 DEs.

**GS, SNEA :** First we are meeting after a long time. We have to do analysis at the time of absorption, there was understanding that upto DGM level you will get non functional promotion and based on performance and other grading which will be decided by Management, regular promotion will be given upto STS level. Eligibility qualifying service will be 4-5 years. But it will not exceed 6 years but not less than 4 years. But once policy is given in paper, earlier DOT setup functional promotion was continued. Another financial

A-I/G



2

upgradation is not given. Even the people who have at the time of absorption they were called Manager. In the field unit designation is not changed. In Corporate office, designation was changed. We have made entire thing mess. We have terms and conditions of absorption. We have to keep it in mind, we were assured 5 promotions at the time of absorption. Three parameters were have to worked out mechanism (i) promotion in 4-6 years, (ii) 5 promotions, (3) promotion upto grade of JAG level. This is not implemented till date. This is what pending for implementation from 2000. There can be more people or less people. Without disturbing the work, we have to change the system if more people is given the promotion. If more person is getting promotion, the number of staff will be reduced. Designation followed in Corporate office needs to be implemented in field unit also.

**GS, AIBSNLEA :** Respected Sir, we are thankful to you for continue holding of this meeting. One of the important issue is the revision of E1A and E2A pay scales. Further I would like to mention, you have not mentioned the cost implication. Our firm opinion is while upgrading to E2 and E3 scales, senior people pay scales should be upgraded. Our firm demand is all pay scales should be upgraded irrespective of cadres. Our two cadres, SDE and Sr SDE can continue to work in one grade.

Regarding this CPSU cadre hierarchy, why we are raising the issue again and again. At the time of absorption, in our absorption terms and conditions it was mentioned that non-post promotion upto JAG level and post based promotion upto STS level. But unfortunately BSNL Mangement has not implemented this. We are demanding what we have been promised at the time of absorption. We were promised that there will be CPSU hierarchy and our promotion avenue will be like other PSUs. We have exercised our option. We are facing obstruction in functional promotion. We have resigned Government set-up. We want assured career progression, functional time bound promotion upto selection grade of SAG. Even if JTO is promoted to SDE on time bound manner, his post should be changed to SDE and he should be given role and responsibility of SDE. ITS officers in BSNL has been given Sr GM level promotion. ITS officers, who are posted in BSNL Corporate Office have been given Sr GM designation. Here in my case I am getting time bound promotion grade after holding DPC. I was not given designation. Why discrimination is happed to me. Why I am not given designation and role & responsibility. When we are demanding upto selection grade JAG. In the present setup we are getting first time bound promotion, in the same scale we are getting functional promotion and we are getting one increment. In society, I can tell that I am promoted to the level of JAG or DGM or GM. Social status is there. So we are requesting you CPSU cadre hierarchy. On time bound promotion, my designation should be changed and my functional responsibility should be changed. \* Post based promotion can be done from DGM to GM level. The criteria should be decided to promote the people from DGM to GM, GM to CGM. Already we are having bench mark for promotion. Regarding bench mark in time bound promotion, our bench marks are somewhat lighter but in post based promotion it was tighter. What Madam GM(Estt.) was telling that if we are giving promotion to DE grade, there are 13000 executives. If we calculate, there are 5300 sanctioned posts. 1300 is DGM posts. In DGM grade, also 4000 to 5000 executives are drawing DGM salary. There will be 2 to 3 DE for each DGM. In the year 2016 majority of the executives are going to retire. In 2018, 18000 executives will be retiring. In four years, your ratio will be zero. In 2019 almost all will retire, who is getting promotion in 2014. Only 10% will remain.

A-I/7



**GS, AIGETOA :** As far as my understanding for Company requirement of the executives is that there can be parity with other Organisation. Graduate engineer recruited as JTO is still working as JTO after 15 years of service. This should be changed otherwise whatever 5000 DGM or 13000 DGMs you are promoting, you can not expect performance from people. The company requirement should also be taken into consideration. I do not see company requirement is going to suffer. When I was recruited as JTO, our SDE was working like GM. Now our lineman is sitting ideal and SDE is working in field because a lineman can not configure modem. There has been lot of difference in today's DET and earlier DET. We have to see our own people. As far as financial purpose is there I am happier person but social status are not being fulfilled. If I compare myself with a person working with other Organisation, I feel more social degraded. This is de-motivating me. We have to adopt a welcome approach. If today everybody is getting promotion in five years why can not we see that 10% people are out performer. You can promote this 10% people. In every CPSE, the eligibility is three years. You have tried 10% and you have promoted 10% people on performance basis.

If you really wanted to become the market leader, you have to improve the performance. By simply writing letters to CMD and Directors, it may not happen. Definitely you can enhance bench mark. Today hierarchy may be disturbed but after 5 years from now we have to support regular people because you have not regularised these people. This is failure of the Management to regulate the number of people at feeder grade. I have already said that financially I am most happier person but it is not fulfilling my social status.

**GM(EF) :** The EPP was given by DOT. Time bound promotion upto DE NFS level. This is what the situation is. It is not desirable that a person working as JTO is getting DGM level salary. There should be designation for time bound promotion post. There is functional requirement of organisational structure. The post requirement should be changed and role can be defined. Without that it is not possible to give promotion to every scale. Competency is required at every level. It is not possible to give as there is no HRD in organisation. Their function is to be defined. There should be motivation. People should be given chance to meritorious performer. That criteria should be worked out. There should be certain percentage of persons that has to be worked out. From the lower level that many people can go upto higher level.

#### Open discussion :

**GS, AIBSNLEA :** Organisation when needed me to get absorbed, told me something but after my absorption you are telling me different things.

**GS, AIGETOA :** Our demand is upto DGM level but what you are saying that only few can get the promotion.

**GM(EF) :** We are getting much better policy.

**ED(NB) :** There are two streams of promotion. One is EPP and second is functional. There should be a policy and there should be one promotional stream. The bench mark will be stringent and all can not be promoted. One who is smarter and good will get

A-I/8



4

upgradation is not given. Even the people who have at the time of absorption they were called Manager. In the field unit designation is not changed. In Corporate office, designation was changed. We have made entire thing mess. We have terms and conditions of absorption. We have to keep it in mind, we were assured 5 promotions at the time of absorption. Three parameters were have to worked out mechanism (i) promotion in 4-6 years, (ii) 5 promotions, (3) promotion upto grade of JAG level. This is not implemented till date. This is what pending for implementation from 2000. There can be more people or less people. Without disturbing the work, we have to change the system if more people is given the promotion. If more person is getting promotion, the number of staff will be reduced. Designation followed in Corporate office needs to be implemented in field unit also.

**GS, AIBSNLEA :** Respected Sir, we are thankful to you for continue holding of this meeting. One of the important issue is the revision of E1A and E2A pay scales. Further I would like to mention, you have not mentioned the cost implication. Our firm opinion is while upgrading to E2 and E3 scales, senior people pay scales should be upgraded. Our firm demand is all pay scales should be upgraded irrespective of cadres. Our two cadres, SDE and Sr SDE can continue to work in one grade.

Regarding this CPSU cadre hierarchy, why we are raising the issue again and again. At the time of absorption, in our absorption terms and conditions it was mentioned that non-post promotion upto JAG level and post based promotion upto STS level. But unfortunately BSNL Mangement has not implemented this. We are demanding what we have been promised at the time of absorption. We were promised that there will be CPSU hierarchy and our promotion avenue will be like other PSUs. We have exercised our option. We are facing obstruction in functional promotion. We have resigned Government set-up. We want assured career progression, functional time bound promotion upto selection grade of SAG. Even if JTO is promoted to SDE on time bound manner, his post should be changed to SDE and he should be given role and responsibility of SDE. ITS officers in BSNL has been given Sr GM level promotion. ITS officers, who are posted in BSNL Corporate Office have been given Sr GM designation. Here in my case I am getting time bound promotion grade after holding DPC. I was not given designation. Why discrimination is happed to me. Why I am not given designation and role & responsibility. When we are demanding upto selection grade JAG. In the present setup we are getting first time bound promotion, in the same scale we are getting functional promotion and we are getting one increment. In society, I can tell that I am promoted to the level of JAG or DGM or GM. Social status is there. So we are requesting you CPSU cadre hierarchy. On time bound promotion, my designation should be changed and my functional responsibility should be changed. Post based promotion can be done from DGM to GM level. The criteria should be decided to promote the people from DGM to GM, GM to CGM. Already we are having bench mark for promotion. Regarding bench mark in time bound promotion, our bench marks are somewhat lighter but in post based promotion it was tighter. What Madam GM(Estt.) was telling that if we are giving promotion to DE grade, there are 13000 executives. If we calculate, there are 5300 sanctioned posts. 1300 is DGM posts. In DGM grade, also 4000 to 5000 executives are drawing DGM salary. There will be 2 to 3 DE for each DGM. In the year 2016 majority of the executives are going to retire. In 2018, 18000 executives will be retiring. In four years, your ratio will be zero. In 2019 almost all will retire, who is getting promotion in 2014. Only 10% will remain.

A-I/9



5


GM(EF) : What is followed in other PSU has to be seen.

DGM(Pers.) : GM(Restg.) has already prepared it.

ED(NB) : The performance level criteria should be balanced. Otherwise, who is poor performer will not be getting any promotion. Criteria should be made. Main issue is criteria.

Further, it is decided that the next meeting of the Committee will be held on 5.8.2015 at 11.00 hours.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks by Shri Manish Kumar, Convenor.

  
ED(NB)

GM(Estt.)

GM(EF)

GS, AIBSNLEA

GS, SNEA(I)

GS, AIGETOA

A-I/10



## Minutes of Meeting

Minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> meeting of the committee to discuss CPSU Cadre hierarchy related matters held on 5<sup>th</sup> August, 2015 at 11.00 A.M. in the Committee Room of 8<sup>th</sup> Floor, Bharat Sanchar Bhawan and following were present:

1. Shri. M.A. Khan, ED(NB) - Chairman
2. Mrs. Madhu Arora, GM (Estt.)- Member
3. Mrs. Smita Choudhary, GM (EF) - Member
4. Shri Prehlad Rai, GS, AIBSNLEA - Member
5. Shri K. Sebastin, GS, SNEA (I) - Member
6. Shri R.P. Sahu, GS, AIGETOA - Member
7. Shri Manish Kumar, DGM (Pers.)- Convenor

Shri Manish Kumar welcomed all. Minutes of last meeting was already circulated among the members and it needs some corrections/modifications.

ED(NB) welcomed all and told that work on CPSU hierarchy is important. About 50000 executives are from JTO and equivalent cadre up to DGM level in BSNL. The ratio at present is 22:19:4:1 with JTO to SDE and DE to DGM and equivalent. If 33 years service span is taken then we may devise the method of promotion for JTO to SDE 5 years, SDE to Sr. SDE 5 years and Sr. SDE to DE 5 years and DE to DGM in 8 years or so. It means about 4 promotions in 23 years span of service. ED(NB) also expressed that the benchmark may be kept tight. There should be a provision of interview to filter. Marks may be given for selection as 30% for APARs, 20 % for service in the existing post and 50% for interview etc. EPP and existing post based promotion may be replaced by above. Table 1 of 8.2 of report given by GM (Restrgr.) may be utilized for seniority and service.

### GM (Restructuring):

Procedure for promotion on the basis of APAR and seniority is right. But on the issue to conduct interview at each and every level is not appropriate. Interview should be started at higher level only. Only E7 onwards there is a requirement of interview. The only problem in interview is its one person questioning subjectivity complaint. Since BSNL is a very large organization and its spread throughout the country in which 20000 or 30000 people are participating in interview it becomes very-very subjective thinking.

### GM (EF) told:

Promotion criteria of some other PSUs like ONGC, NTP may also be read out for the same. It can easily be searched from Internet. A copy of ONGC promotion criteria was also placed in the meeting. It is not possible to promote all the cadre so there is need for filtration. ONGC conducts interview at each level i.e. E4 to E5, E5 to E6 and E6 to E7 level from 01.01.2002 onwards. At least top ten CPSUs promotional mechanism should be followed and then take a decision.

### GS-SNEA told:

40000 Executives came to BSNL after absorption. 11000 JTOs were recruited. Assurance was given without linking with availability of post that up to JAG-SG promotion will be given. Beyond DGM availability of post will be seen. Time bound pay-upgradation was only given. Club both post based promotion and time bound promotion. JTO who has completed 20 years of service, he is still working as JTO. 11000 SDE posts are vacant than why we are not getting promotion. It is just because of Court Cases. Many JTOs are working at E4 scale. BSNL cannot be compared with

A-I/11



2  
production sectors PSUs like ONGC etc.. In BSNL executives are in office, outdoor, indoor etc. so in BSNL evaluation system has to evolved differently. Detailed submission has already given.

GS-AIBSNEA told:

We were recruited by DOT and based on certain terms and conditions. We were absorbed in BSNL with assured promotion up to DGM (Non-post based promotion). Post based promotion will be beyond SAG. Executive Promotion Policy have 2 Tier promotion. EPP and Post based. My question is 2 Tier promotion policy should be abolished. I should be given designation on post based. Under EPP post based promotion benchmarks are already there. Same should be kept. Designation based/post based is never operated in BSNL. ~~For higher qualification additional 10% extra marks may be given.~~ I have completed 35 years of service. I have got only 2 promotions and now only DE.

GS-AIGETOA told:

In existing promotion policy JTO to SDE up to 12 years people are not becoming DGM as no DPC for DE to DGM for 5 years. At least 15 years of service span one person should reach to DGM but not a single person could reach to DGM post. JTO recruitment is not done. If we increase service span up to 24 years than how we will face members. Today SDE works like TMs. I am working 15 years in BSNL. My counterpart is DGM in other CPSUs. It affect our social standard. It is the responsibility of company to solve my needs. In CPSU single feeder level should be decided. Out of JTO they should have scope to reach to GM level. Up to DGM functional promotion we should get JTO feeder cadre. In 15 years he should become DGM. The promotion should on performance APAR 50%, Service Grade/Seniority 40% and Degree/Higher qualification i.e. M.Tech/MBA at 10%.

Discussion started:

Association members told that they are getting money by EPP but their social status is lower. To upgrade the social status of executives it is necessary to give them Post based promotion. There is no interview up to E7 Scale in other PSUs then why it is suggested to implement in BSNL. Promotion Criteria may be as under:

JTO to SDE – 5 years

SDE to Sr. SDE – 5 years

Sr. SDE to DE – 6 years

DE to DGM – 8 years

Here E2-SDE, E3-Sr. SDE, E4-AGM, E5-DGM and E6 is Addl. GM

The promotion should be based on performance of 50 marks of APAR and APAR benchmark should be very good or so

Service grade of 40 marks (length of service residing in the scale)

Higher qualification of 10 marks (M.Tech/MBA etc.)

Next meeting for further discussion will take place and it will be held on 13<sup>th</sup> August, 2015 at 3.00 p.m. on 8<sup>th</sup> floor, Committee Hall.

ED(NB)

GM (Estt.)

GM (EF)

GS AIBSNLEA

GS SNEA (I)

GS AGETOA

A-I/12



## GS AIGETOA comments on CPSE cadre hierarchy

27-07-2015

As far as my understanding promotion of the executives must fulfill the executive aspiration as well as company requirement. To fulfill the executive's aspiration company should maintain the parity in promotion with other Category-A CPSEs so that BSNL executives should not feel socially degraded. We cannot expect better performance simply by upgrading executives financially and not giving responsibility and designation of the scale. We cannot compare the status of SDE/DE/DGM in DOT era with present status in CPSE. Earlier SDE status in DOT era was a powerful post but in today's scenario SDE has to work on subscriber premises by visiting and configuring the broadband modems as lineman and phone mechanic are not that much technically upgraded. Similarly there is lot of difference in status of DET/DGM in DOT era in comparison to present scenario hence promoting executives up to DGM in BSNL should not be compared with promoting people up to DGM in DOT. As for as financial position is seen I am happier person than other CPSEs as I am working as JTO and taking the salary of DET but when I compare with other CPSEs wherein our counterparts executives are called DGM by this time hence I feel socially degraded which demotivate me. We must adopt similar promotion policy like in other CPSEs of Schedule-A categories. Other CPSEs starts promoting executives after completing 3 years of service in a grade with bell curve approach. BSNL may also adopt the similar policy by enhancing bench marks wherein at least 10% outperformer may get promotion in 3 years from one grade to another grade rest in 4 and 5 years depending on the benchmarks. If we really want to become a market leader simple appeal of CMD and directors to perform in field will not work, we have to adopt these things in policy where performers get benefits in career enhancement.

Today hierarchy may disturbed but after 4-5 years by regulating the recruitment at feeder level and making regular recruitment we can achieve the pyramid structure also. In fact today also there is no pyramid structure in existence. This situation has come because instead of making regulated and regular recruitment at feeder level BSNL management has made bulk and discreet recruitment in a gap of 4-5 years.

05-08-2015

- BSNL must formulate the career policy of the executives which value the performance and have scope for all feeder cadre executives to reach to apex post of the company by their talent. Policy must not block the career of executives at certain level but it must be open ended for performing and talented executives. There must be single feeder level in executives like other CPSEs. As per the proposal of Chairman Career of all executives of BSNL will be blocked at DGM level and will retire before getting promotion of GM which is not at all acceptable.
- It is responsibility of the company to provide career path and designation to feeder cadre executives at par with similarly placed CPSE of schedule-A category so that their social status remains maintained at par with similarly placed executives in other CPSEs.

A-I/13



- As per the existing policy executives recruited at JTO/JAO level are eligible in three years for SDE/AO and in next 7 years for DE/CAO. It means there is scope for executives to become DE in just 10 years. It is only because of administrative failure or legal hurdle promotions are not executed in time. We are sitting here to discuss to come out from such hurdles and better career opportunity than existing one at par with leading CPSEs of the country hence any new policy must not snatch existing scope from executives for smooth implementation.
- BSNL itself has considered that an engineering graduate/CA/ICWA and equivalent having post qualification experience of 12 years out of which 5 years in a company having turnover of Rs 100 Cr are competent enough to handle the responsibility of DGM in BSNL hence career enhancement policy of BSNL must ensure that executives recruited at feeder cadre i.e. JTO/JAO having qualification of engineering graduate/CA/ICWA etc become eligible for DGM in 12 years i.e. executives must gain 3 years of service on E4 in just 12 years to satisfy the existing DGM RR. When one outsider candidate can become DGM in BSNL just in 12 years why not BSNL executives who possess all the qualification and experience at higher side?
- New Career enhancement policy must also satisfy the Absorption condition of absorbed executives wherein they have been assured to get minimum 5 time bound promotion irrespective of vacancies in the span of 4-6 years.
- New policy must not be made considering the present strength of executives at each level as lot of executives are going to retire in next 2-3 years but policy must be framed considering above submission and strength of executives at each cadre must be regulated over the time to achieve the pyramid structure.
- To satisfy all these conditions BSNL must scrap time bound financial upgradation and implement time bound functional promotion up to SG-JAG level adopting bell curve approach in line with leading CPSEs of the country i.e. minimum eligibility for promotion from one grade to next grade must be three years and maximum five years so that out performing executives have opportunity to get early promotion than non-performer. This will not only maintain the social parity of executives at par with leading CPSEs but also motivate executives towards performance and hence productivity of the company will increase.

A-I/14



Sanctioned and Working Strength of JTOs as on 01/01/2015

Sanctioned	Working Strength	Vacant Posts
39178	15087	24091

Sanctioned and Working Strength of SDEs as on 01/01/2015

Sanctioned	No. of Vacancies	Working Strength
25591	Seniority - cum- Fitness Quota (67%) - 6632	9277
	Competitive Quota (33%) - 4214	5468
	<b>Total = 10846</b>	<b>14745</b>

Sanctioned and Working Strength of AGMs (TF) as on 01/08/2015

Sanctioned	Working Strength	Vacant posts
26	17	9

Sanctioned and Working Strength of AGMs (T) as on 01/08/2015

Sanctioned	Working Strength	Vacant posts
5303	3079	2224

Sanctioned and Working Strength of DGMs (T) as on 01/08/2015

Sanctioned	Working Strength	Vacant posts
1331	550	781

Sanctioned and Working Strength of DGMs (TF) as on 01/08/2015

Sanctioned	Working Strength	Vacant posts
14	04	10

Sanctioned and Working Strength of DR-DGM as on 01/08/2015

Sanctioned	Working Strength	Vacant posts
150	43	107

Sanctioned and Working Strength of GMs as on 01/08/2015

Sanctioned	Working Strength	Vacant Posts
564	Unabsorbed - 286*	247
	Absorbed - 31	
	<b>Total = 317</b>	<b>247</b>

\* includes 33 officers Repatriated to DoT.

A-I/15





PROMOTION POLICY OF BSNL  
AND OTHER CPSUs

A-I/16



**TELECOM CONSULTANTS INDIA LIMITED**  
**(TCIL)**

A-I/17



## TELECOM CONSULTANTS INDIA LIMITED

- Executives having qualifications as BE/B.Tech/B.Arch/CA/ICWA/CS/MBA(Full time/Part time)/MCA (Full time/Part time)/PG Diploma (equivalent to MBA) from an Institution of repute(Full time/Part time)/LLB/Post Graduate in Physics, Maths, Statistics and Operation Research with one year Diploma in Computer/AMIE/IETE are considered for promotion on completion of every 3 years up to E5 level. Eligibility period for promotion from E5 to E6 level is 4 years, from E6 to E7 is 5 years and from E7 to E8 is 6 years.
- Promotions up to E5 level are carried out on up-gradation basis. Beyond E5, promotions are given against vacancies on need basis.
- The number of posts in E6, E7 and E8 grades are fixed.
- Executives who are Graduate s or have two years' Draftsman Diploma and Executive Secretaries are eligible for promotion after every five years up to E3 level. For promotion to E4 level, the eligibility period is 6 years and from E5 to E5, 7 years.

A-I/18



## TELECOM CONSULTANTS INDIA LIMITED

- All promotions are on the basis of recommendations of DPC. For promotions from E6 level onwards, DPC conducts personal interviews in addition to performance appraisal. Cases are put up to DPC only if the employee fulfils the following criteria besides performance:
  - In the last 5 years, the employee should have been posted at any project out of NCR in India or abroad for two years.
  - If the employee does not fulfil condition at (a), he/she will give consent for posting at project out of NCR for 2 years. In such cases, promotion orders are effective from the date the employee joins at new posting.

A-I/19



# TCIL PAY SCALES & DESIGNATIONS

Sl. No.	Grade	Cadre	Pay-Scale(Rs.)
1	E1	Engineer	16400-40500
2	E2	Assistant Manager	20600-46500
3	E3	Dy. Manager	24900-50500
4	E4	Manager	29100-54500
5	E5	Sr. Manager	32900-58000
6	E6	Joint General Manager	36600-62000
7	E7	General Manager	43200-66000
8	E8	Group General Manager	51300-73000
9	E9	Executive Director	62000-80000
11	E10	Director	75000-100000
12		CMD	80000-125000

A-I/20



**BHARAT HEAVY ELECTRICALS LIMITED**  
**(BHEL)**

A-I/21



# BHEL PAYSCALES & DESIGNATIONS

S.No.	Grade	Designation	Pay Scale (Rs.)
1	E1	Engineer / Accounts Officer / Executives	24900-50500
2	E2	Sr. Engineer / Sr. Accounts Officer / Sr. Executives	29100-54500
3	E3	Dy. Manager	32900-58000
4	E4	Manager	36600-62000
5	E5	Sr. Manager	43200-66000
6	E6	Dy. General Manager	43200-66000
7	E6A	Sr. Dy. General Manager	51300-73000
8	E7	Additional General Manager	51300-73000
9	E8	General Manager	51300-73000
10	E9	Executive Director	62000-80000
11		Director	75000-100000
12		CMD	80000-125000

A-I/22



## BHARAT HEAVY ELECTRICALS LIMITED

- Promotions in Executive grade up to E7:

Promotion from E1 to E7 and percentage of Executive prescribed for promotion are as follows:

Grade	Eligibility period (years)	Percentage
E1 to E2	4	85
E2 to E3	4	67.5
E3 to E4	3	55
E4 to E5	3	42.5
E5 to E6	3	35
E6 to E6A	3	100
E6A to E7	1	25

A-I/23



## BHARAT HEAVY ELECTRICALS LIMITED

- Eligibility for promotion and percentage of employees to be promoted are flexible and decided on year to year basis.
- There are no interviews for promotions up to AGM level.
- 10% of the candidates recommended for promotion are from those who are coming up for consideration for the first time. Such candidates should have substantially large number of Outstanding/Excellent ACRs in total career. They should possess induction level qualification or, in exceptional cases, one level below induction level qualification. Also, they should have earned at least 3 Outstanding/Excellent reports during last 5 years, 2 of which should be during last 3 years.
- 'MAP' scores being equal or more than 4.85 and PMS marks being equal or more than 85 are treated as Excellent. (Linkage to High Performance Levels)
- Stagnation Promotion is given in promotions from E5 to E6 and E6A to E7 to candidates who have spent 3 years more than normal eligibility period in the grade, have performed well and are deserving of encouragement, and are not likely to knock on the doors for becoming GMs in future.
- Pre-retirement Promotion not exceeding 3 months prior to retirement is given to those who have spent minimum 1 year more than normal eligibility period in the grade, have performed well and are deserving of appreciation, and have induction level qualification or, in exceptional cases, one level below induction level qualifications.

A-7/24



## BHARAT HEAVY ELECTRICALS LIMITED

- Number of candidates recommended for Stagnation Promotion and Pre-retirement Promotion should not exceed 50% of such cases and this number is in addition to the promotion prescribed percentages.
- Bell Curve approach is adopted for 'capping' of promotions at different levels and percentage of employees are dropped (not promoted) depending upon requirement of the company.
- Marking System for Promotion is as follows:

Performance	:	60
Qualifications	:	20
Experience	:	10
Suitability	:	10

A-I/25



NATIONAL THERMAL POWER CORPORATION

(NTPC)

A-I/26



# NTPC PAYSCALES & DESIGNATIONS

No.	Grade	Grade	Pay Scale
1	E1	Asstt. Engineer / Asstt. Officer	20600-46500
2	E2	Sr. Asstt. Engineer / Sr. Asstt. Officer	24900-50500
3	E2A	Engineer / Officer	24900-50500
4	E3	Sr. Engineer / Sr. Officer	29100-54500
5	E4	Dy. Manager / Dy. Superintendent	32900-58000
6	E5	Manager / Superintendent	36600-62000
7	E6	Sr. Manager / Chief Manager / Sr. Superintendent	43200-66000
8	E7	Dy. General Manager	51300-73000
9	E7A	Addl. General Manager	51300-73000
10	E8	General Manager	51300-73000
11	E9	Executive Director	62000-80000
		Director	75000-100000
		CMD	80000-125000



## NATIONAL THERMAL POWER CORPORATION

Factors taken into account for determining suitability for promotion:

For promotions up to E4 (except E2 - E2A)	Performance appraisal ratings for last 3 years - 24	Marks awarded for Grade Service
	Grade Service - 16	For 3 years - 10
	(Qualifying marks for promotion are 30)	For 4 years - 13
		For 5 years and above - 16
For promotions from E2 to E2A)	Performance appraisal ratings for last year - 8	For 1 year - 3
	Grade Service - 4	For 2 years and above - 4
	(Qualifying marks for promotion are 8)	
	Performance appraisal ratings for last 3 years - 30	For 3 year - 8
For promotions from E4 to E5	Grade Service - 15	For 4 years - 10
	CPC - 15	For 5 years - 12
	(Qualifying marks for promotion are 45)	For 6 years & above - 15
	Performance appraisal ratings for last 4 years - 40	
	Grade Service - 20	For 4 year - 12
	CPC - 20	For 5 years - 14
For promotions from E5 to E6 and E6 to E7	(Qualifying marks for promotion are 60)	For 6 years - 17
		For 7 years & above - 20



## NATIONAL THERMAL POWER CORPORATION

- Promotions to the grade of E5, E6 and E7 are subject to notified vacancies. However, vacancy is not a constraint for promotion up to E4 level. Percentages are assigned for promotions upto E4 level similar to BHEL.
- It is essential to clear a departmental examination of standard equivalent to Bachelor in Engineering for any Executive who possesses only Diploma in Engineering, to be promoted beyond the grade of Deputy Manager. This condition can be relaxed by CMD in exceptional cases.
- For promotion from E6 to E7, field exposure is considered desirable.
- Eligibility period for promotion of Executives in the following grades to the next higher grade is as follows:

E2	1 year
E1, E2A, E3 & E4	3 years
E5 & E6	4 years

A-I/29



15

## NATIONAL THERMAL POWER CORPORATION

- In addition to performance evaluation on the basis record, promotion of Executives in E5 & E6 grades will also be on the basis of interview.
- In case of promotions to E5, CPC awards upto a max. 15 marks and in case of promotions to E6 & Et, 20 marks to each executive keeping in view
- (a) desirability of giving special recognition to experience and performance in the field consistent with Company's priorities;



## NATIONAL THERMAL POWER CORPORATION

- (b) need to ensure uniformity, consistency and equitability;
- © potential and suitability for the specific job position;
- (d) general conduct, personality and sense of involvement and commitment to the organization;
- (e) upward or downward trend in the appraisal ratings. In case of upward trend, CPC might consider awarding higher marks as compared to the cases where there has been a downward trend, other things remaining equal.



## NATIONAL THERMAL POWER CORPORATION

- All Executives promoted to the grades of E6 & E7 are placed on probation to a period of one year from the date of assumption of charge in the next higher grade. The period of probation may be extended at the discretion of the Competent Authority.
- Every Executive promoted to the higher grade, will be issued a formal order of confirmation on satisfactory completion of the probationary period or the extended period of probation, if applicable. He/She will be deemed to be on probation until so confirmed in writing.
- No employee whose Performance Appraisal Report for the last year is "unsatisfactory" is considered for promotion.
- If during the probationary period or extended period of probation of an Executive, the performance is not found satisfactory or up to the standard required for the promotion post, the Executive is reverted to the pre-promotion grade and is not considered for promotion for one year from the date of reversion.

A-I/32



**No of Executives working in each grade.** Majority of the Executives are working in Telecom Engg wing. **The total number is about 34,500.**

JTO Scale	-- About 4800 (2008, 2014).
SDE Scale	-- About 4300 (2005, 2007) (all are JTOs).
Sr SDE Scale	-- About 11800 (1993 to 2002) (SDE --4500, JTO -- 7700).
AGM Scale	-- About 7800 (1989, 1990, 1991, 1992 – list 6 → 4850) (All SDEs).
DGM Scale	-- About 5200 (DE -- 3100, SDE -- 2100).
SG JAG Scale	-- About 600 (AGM, DGM).

**Accounts – 6500.**

JAO grade	-- About 2600
AO grade	-- About 3200
CAO grade	-- About 650
DGM grade	-- About 350

**Civil – 1747 (December, 2014).**

JTO grade	-- About 619
SDE grade	-- About 951
EE grade	-- About 125
DGM grade	-- About 52

**Elect: 1134 (December, 2014)**

JTO grade	-- About 517
SDE grade	-- About 539
EE grade	-- About 48
DGM grade	-- About 30

**Arch --- 147 (December, 2014)**

JTO grade	-- About 106
SDE grade	-- About 27
EE grade	-- About 7
DGM grade	-- About 7

**TF --- 122 (December, 2014)**

JTO grade	-- About 54
SDE grade	-- About 41
EE grade	-- About 21
DGM grade	-- About 6

**Misc – 425 (December, 2014).**

JTO grade	-- About 311
SDE grade	-- About 86
EE grade	-- About 22
DGM grade	-- About 6