



**ALL INDIA
BHARAT SANCHAR NIGAM LIMITED
EXECUTIVES' ASSOCIATION**

**Central Headquarters
New Delhi -110001**

President
Subhasis Mitra
Mob:094320 01010
E-mail: presidentaibsnlea@gmail.com

General Secretary
S. Sivakumar
Mob:09486102121
E-mail:gsaibsnlea@gmail.com

Financial Secretary
Ramnath Chabra
Mob: :09868231711
E-mail: fsaibsnleachq@gmail.com

No:AIBSNLEA/CHQ/PGM (Pers.) /2021

Dated:19.07.2021

To,

Shri R.K. Goyal,
PGM (Pers) & Chairman of the Committee
BSNL CO, New Delhi - 110001

Subject: Submission of Comments/ Inputs by AIBSNLEA for the consideration of the Committee constituted to Examine the Pay Loss issue of Executives recruited in E1A Pay Scale (Issue of Rs 22820/- as initial Basic Pay in the respect of the directly recruited JTOs of 2007and 2008 Batches and directly recruited JAO of 2010 Batch).

Ref: 1) BSNL CO.Lr.No.A/11/ (11)/1/2021-EST-AB dated 14.7.2021
2)BSNL CO Lr. No. 1-17/2016-PAT (BSNL) dated10.01.2017
3) Lr.No. AIBSNLEA/CHQ/Dir (HR)/2017 dated 17.02.2017
4)Lr. No.AIBSNLEA /CHQ/22820/CMD/2020 dated:02.07.2020
5) Lr. No. AIBSNLEA/CHQ/CMD/2020 dated 22.07.2020

Respected Sir,

We would like to draw your kind attention on the above cited subject. In this regard, we wish to submit that in BSNL, the basic pay and the Pay Scales of the Executives recruited prior to 01.01.2007 and after 01.01.2007 onwards are entirely different which created widespread resentment among the Executives recruited after 01.01.2007. There is a huge difference in Pay to the tune of Rs 10,000/- between the two sets of Executives. Even their Pay scales are not finalized so far. They are demoted to a lower Pay scale and placed in E1 scale provisionally. This Association has representing this matter at different level for quite long time. Consequent to this the Management constituted a Committee to examine the issue of Pay Parity.

We would like to submit the below mentioned facts for the Examination and consideration of the Committee and positive Recommendations at the earliest.

- i) JTOs of 2005, 2007, 2008 batches (including Departmental Outside JTOs) and the 2010 batch DR JAOs were recruited and appointed in the Pre-revised Pay Scale of 9850-250-14600 and were drawing Rs 9850/- as entry level Pay. In fact the 2007, 2008 batch JTOs and 2010 DR JAOs joined prior to the 2010 batch JAOs (Deptl candidates). More interestingly even 2007 batch JTOs joined prior to some of the 2005 batch JTOs. In other words, JTOs of 2007 and 2008 batches and direct recruited JAOs of 2010 batch are similarly placed with the JTOs of 2005 batch

(joined after 01.01.2007) and 2010 batch JAOs (Deptl candidates). There was no difference in basic pay between 2005 batch JTOs or 2010 batch JAOs (Dept) and 2007, 2008, 2010 batch JTO/JAOs as all were drawing Rs 9850/- as initial basic pay up-to January 2012.

- ii) On implementation of 2nd PRC in BSNL, the initial basic pay of JTOs of 2005, 2007, 2008 batches and directly recruited JAOs of 2010 batch who joined after 01.01.2007 got fixed at Rs.19020/- (E1+5 increments) provisionally vide Order No. 1- 29/2010-PAT(BSNL) dated 03.01.2012). This has been done to compensate the reduction in the salary as revised pay scales for E1A and E2A are not approved by DoT and BSNL implemented E1 and E2 Pay Scales provisionally in place of E1A and E2A. Further this benefit has been extended to the JAO batch 2010 under 40% and 10% quota for Deptt. Candidates vide Order No.1-5/2012-PAT(BSNL) dated 20.12.2012.
- iii) **After implementation of 2nd PRC, initial basic pay of JTOs of 2005 batch joined in BSNL after 01.01.2007 got fixed at Rs. 22820/- vide order No. 1-14/2009-PAT (BSNL) dated 09.12.2013 as a special case in order to remove the disparity in pay between the Executives of the same batch of 2005. This was the first instance of relaxation.**
- iv) **The benefit of fitment and option under para 3.6 of Non-Executives Wage revision order has been extended to the employees of CSS cadre who have been promoted to the grade of Asstt. Manager in BSNL Corporate Office and joined after 07.05.2010. This was the second instance of relaxation.**
- v) **Similarly JAOs of 2010 Batch (40% quota-Dept candidates) were allowed to exercise the option under para 3.6 of Non-Executives wage revision order for fixation of pay in the revised pay scale from the date of promotion in the grade of JAO, as per order No.7-4/2010-SEA-BSNL (Pt-I) dated 24.07.2015 again as a one time dispensation. This was the third instance of relaxation.**
- vi) **Likewise JAOs of 2010 Batch (10% quota-Dept candidates) were allowed to exercise the option under para 3.6 of Non-Executives wage revision order for fixation of pay in the revised pay scale from the date of promotion in the grade of JAO, as per order No.BSNL CO-PRII/11(24)/14/202 PERS1 dated 28.8.2020 again as a one time dispensation. This was the fourth instance of relaxation.**
- vii) As a result, after Pay Revision, the entire situation changed and the difference in basic pay of JTO/JAOs of 2007, 2008, 2010 batches become **Rs 3800/- (Rs22820-Rs19020)** comparing to the 2005 batch JTOs and 2010 batch Dept JAOs. If other allowances are added, the real difference in salary today will be around Rs10,000/-. On implementation of 3rd PRC, the difference will further increase and continue with time due to increase in IDA and annual increment. Further all are facing major losses in the form of career progression (time bound promotion), retirement benefits like E.P.F., Gratuity etc., due to discrimination of the initial basic pay compared to other similarly placed JTO/JAOs.
- viii) The Pay of the Non-Executives who were officiating as JAO in the Pay scale of Rs 9850- 250-14600, followed by Regular promotion as JAO after 07.5.2010 has been fixed at Rs.22820 and above in the revised Pay scale w.r.to 2nd PRC recommendation with 30% fitment on the date of their Promotion by exercising option as per the Committee recommendation. But the same benefit has been denied to those who were recruited and appointed in the year 2008, 2009 and 2010 and worked in the Pre revised Pay scale of Rs 9850-14600/- and were drawing the Pay of Rs9850/- in the Pre-revised Scale (plus annual increments) till January 2012.
- ix) Hence it is established that BSNL extended Pay fixation of Rs 22820/- and above in the Revised Pay Scale to the JTOs of 2005 batch (joined after 01.01.2007), the CSS cadres and the JAO 2010 batch (Dept). Similar benefit has to be extended to the JTO/JAOs joined upto 2010, in the

pre-revised Pay Scale of Rs 9850-250- 14600. All the JTO/JAOs who has joined after 01.01.2007 and whose pay were fixed at Rs 9850/- on their appointment cannot have different pay in the name of Pay revision. It is a clear disparity and Pay anomaly among the similarly placed JTO/JAOs as such all the JTO/JAO recruits upto 2010 are to be placed equally, and their initial basic pay may be fixed at Rs 22820/- from the date of their appointment in the Revised IDA Pay Scale of Rs 16400-40500

AIBSNLEA gave presentation for the removal of Pay anomaly in this regard to the Committee headed by PGM (PF) Smt. A. Panda and explained that already some Pay Anomaly cases of JTOs 2005 batch, JAO 2010 batch and Asstt. of CSS cadre have been settled by BSNL Management. In the same line this issue also needs to be settled. The Committee has submitted its report to the Competent Authority for consideration but case remains pending.

- x) The Committee constituted to examine the Pay loss and option issue in respect of the Dept JAOs of 2010 batch at 5(b) of its report observed that ***“However after clarification dtd. 18.5.2011, the Pay of such JAOs got reduced by Rs.2600/-”***. But for the JTO/JAO batches of 2007, 2008 and 2010, whose basic pay was genuinely fixed in pre-revised scale at Rs 9850/-, Management simply ignored the loss of Rs. 3800/- in the basic pay itself after 2nd Pay revision.
- xi) On the cut-off date of 07.05.2010, the same Committee at 5(c) of its report **“observed that there has been no such restriction of any date either in 2nd PRC for Executive dated 05.03.2009 and clarification dated 31.03.2009 or in the recommendation of Wage Revision Committee for Non-Executives”**, which is equally applicable to JTO batches of 2007, 2008 and DR JAOs batch of 2010 who joined prior to the JAOs promoted in year 2010.
- xii) The finding of the earlier Committee constituted to examine the pay loss and option issue for the Dept JAOs of 2010 batch recorded in the note sheet of F.No.7-4/2010- SEA(pt-1) through which Non-Executives, promoted as JAOs after 07.05.2010 were given the option to choose revised scale from the date of promotion reiterates the above submissions. The Committee recommendations in 5(a) to 5(d) with respect to Dept JAOs of 2010 batch is reproduced in the note sheet for the information.

5(a): As per the fitment table, the corresponding to pre-revised Pay of Rs 9850-250-14600 in revised IDA Pay Scale of Rs 16400-40500 is Rs 21620/-, the same has been revised to Rs 22820/- after merger of IDA 78.2% vide order No: 1-16/2010-PAT dated 10.06.2013.

5(b): That after issuance of Wage Revision orders for Non-Executives dated 07.05.2010 and as per the option exercised, the pay of many JAOs in Circle like CHTD, Gujarat, Orissa, Punjab, HP, WTP, NTR, MP, Kerala, CTD, WB etc were fixed as per fitment. However after clarification dtd 18.5.2011, the pay of such JAOs got reduced by Rs.2600/-.

5(c): The Committee observed that there has been no such restriction of any date either in 2nd PRC for Executive dated 05.03.2009 and clarification dated 31.03.2009 or in the recommendation of Wage Revision Committee for Non-Executives.

5(d): The benefit of fitment has also been extended to such employees of CSS cadre who have been promoted to the grade of Asstt.Managers and joined after 07.05.2010.

xiii) Since there is no cut-off date as observed by the earlier Committee at 5(c), BSNL Management has to extend the same benefit of Rs 22820/- for all the Executives recruited even after 2010 also. Further as per records, BSNL operated the Pre-revised Scale till January 2012, giving scope to all the Executives joined/continued upto that date in Rs9850/-and should get the same pay of Rs 22820. **For the JTOs of 2007, 2008 and DR JAOs of 2010, it is a matter of clear discrimination and anomaly and for the later recruits; it is a matter of parity in pay with others.**

xiv) Management may consider the Pay fixation done for the post 2007 recruited Executives in other CPSUs also, on promotion as well as direct recruitment. In OIL (Oil India)similar anomaly addressed by upgradation of the Payscale to next higher payscale for all the Executives.

xv)Some relevant portion of some of the Court orders are reproduced here under:

a) Hon Supreme Court Judgment dated 01.05.1985 in P. Savita, vs. Union of India:

Even though this judgment is on classification of the same cadre based on seniority with two different Pay Scales, the observation at page5 of the judgment is relevant:*“That is, for the same work and same functions, the appellants would get less pay than the other group of Senior Draughtsmen. The explanation is that this division is based on seniority. This cannot be accepted as sufficient to meet the requirements of law. By seniority, a Senior Draughtsman will get higher pay with the increments that he earns proportionate to the number of years he is in service.”*

b) Hon Delhi High Court judgment in UOI & Anr Vs Sanjay Kumar & Ors WP(C)No:2071/2007. *“There cannot be discrimination among employees holding the same posts and doing similar nature of work in terms of their pay scale unless one has higher qualifications”.*

c) Hon Calcutta High court vide case of Mr. Ibrahim Mollah And Anr. vs Union Of India (Uoi) And Ors. On 17 November, 1992 Equivalent citations:

(1994)2CALLT410H Cheldtha t*“That is, for the same work and same functions, the appellants would get less pay than the other group of senior draughtsman. The explanation is that this division is based on seniority. This cannot be accepted as sufficient to meet the requirements of law. By seniority, a senior draughtsman will get higher pay with the increments that he earns proportionate to the number of years he is in service.”*

Sir, BSNL has implemented the 2nd Pay Revision in such a manner that directly recruited Executives (JTO/JAOs) appointed after 01.01.2007 are getting gross salary quite less than the Pre-revised Salary. The Pay revision should benefit the Executives of CPSUs and would help CPSUs to attract and retain talent. But it has created pay disparity between Executives recruited just before and after 01.01.2007 to the tune of more than Rs. 10000/- per month. The pay loss/parity issues of

(1) Post 01.01.2007 appointed JTO of 2005 batch,

(2) All Non-Executives promoted as Executives after 01.01.2007 in the form of option under para 3.6,

(3) Post 07.05.2010 promoted CSS cadre and

(4) Post 07.05.2010 promoted JAOs are addressed by extending **“One time dispensation”**

repeatedly as and when required. The JTOs of 2007, 2008 Batches and DR JAOs of 2010 Batch also recruited in the same Pre-revised Pay Scale of Rs 9850-250-14600 and extended the basic pay of Rs 9850/- or minimum of E1A scale as mentioned in the Recruitment notices. All of them joined prior to the promoted JAOs of 2010 batch and AMs promoted from CSS cadre.

In view of the foregoing facts & Justification, we would request the Committee to recommend and extend the similar relief to the JTOs of 2007, 2008 Batches and DR JAOs of 2010 Batch by fixing their initial basic pay at 22820/- to end the disparity in pay between the Executives.

With Kind regards,

Yours Sincerely,



**(S.Sivakumar)
General Secretary**

Copy for kind information and necessary action to:

- a. Shri. Arvind Vadnerkar, Director (HR), BSNL Board, New Delhi-110001.
- b. Smt. Yojana Das, Director (Fin.), BSNL Board, New Delhi-110001.
- c. Shri.Karuna Raman Tiwari, ,Sr. GM(PF), Committee Member, BSNLCO,NewDelhi-110001.
- d. Shri.SaurabhTyagi,Sr.GM(Estt.),Committee Member, BSNL CO,NewDelhi- 110001.
- e. Ms.Anita Johri, GM (SR), BSNL CO, New Delhi- 110001